

COA # 2010-COA-403 B (IRV)	INDIANAPOLIS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT	Hearing Date NOV. 3, 2010
5860 E. Lowell Ave IRVINGTON		New Case
Applicant: DEREK NORCROSS mailing address: 5860 Lowell Ave Indianapolis, IN 46219		Warren Twp. Benjamin Hunter Council District 21
Owner: Same		
CASE		
IHPC COA: 2010-COA-403 B (IRV)	Authorization of the unapproved removal of all the original wood siding (clapboard and shingle) and trim on the house.	
STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval of a Certificate of Authorization		

STAFF COMMENTS

Background of the Property

The subject house is a 1 ½ story bungalow built c. 1920. The house was covered in aluminum siding at some point, leaving the original wood siding, wood shingles and wood trim intact. The house contained wood lap siding with an approximately 4 ½ - 4 ¾ inch reveal. The front gable and two dormers on the house contained wood shingles. The windows are all original except for the aluminum replacements in a rear addition. The front door also appears to be original.

Background of the Case

On August 3, 2010, IHPC staff received a complaint the siding was being removed from the house at 5860 E. Lowell Ave. Since the owner, Derek Norcross, had previously applied for construction of a garage, staff was able to call him. Mr. Norcross said he removed the aluminum siding and discovered that the wood siding underneath was too deteriorated to restore, so he removed the wood clapboard and shingle siding and wood trim, with the intent to install fiber cement siding material as replacement siding. Mr. Norcross stated he was unaware that approval would be required for this type of work.

New Wood Siding Installation (2010-COA-403 A)

Staff explained that the only way to be able to install the fiber cement siding was to be granted a certificate of authorization by the IHPC at a public hearing, which would take time and there was no guarantee of approval. Mr. Norcross was eager for approval to re-side his house, since it was open to the elements. Staff offered to grant a certificate of appropriateness for real wood clapboard and shingle siding to match the original, provided he apply to the IHPC for a certificate of authorization for the work he had already done. Staff offered this for two reasons;

1. The original siding was gone and the only appropriate resolution was to re-side the house with real wood siding, and
2. It was in the best interest of the house's preservation that it be re-sided quickly and not be unduly exposed to the elements.

On September 02, 2010, IHPC staff approved a COA to allow Mr. Norcross to install new wood siding, trim and wood shingles in order to protect the un-sided home from the elements. A copy of the COA is attached.

Irvington Preservation Plan

The Irvington Preservation Plan states that removal of original wood siding is not recommended. It also states that if replacement of siding is justified, avoid using any material other than real wood to match the original. In this case, fiber cement siding would not have been considered an appropriate material if staff were able to justify replacement of the original siding that was underneath the aluminum.

Certificate of Authorization

Unfortunately, the original wood siding, trim and wood shingling was discarded before staff could inspect it. Although Mr. Norcross alleges that it was deteriorated beyond repair, whether or not its condition justified removal cannot be confirmed. Also, unlike the removal of some architectural elements, this original siding and trim cannot be reinstalled.

Only a small section of wood shingles and a small piece of lap siding remained on the house. While this is not enough to determine the condition, it was enough to verify the type and dimensions. After much discussion and consideration, Mr. Norcross decided to agree to staff’s recommendation on how to resolve this matter:

1. Forgo the plan to install fiber cement siding, and
2. Agree to replace the siding with wood siding to match the original.

Staff believes this is the most reasonable and appropriate solution, given the reality of the situation. Staff also appreciates Mr. Norcross’s willingness to forgo his original plans and pursue a more appropriate solution. Therefore, staff is recommending that the IHPC grant a certificate of authorization for the unapproved removal of the original siding, on the condition that he install the appropriate siding approved by staff in 2010-COA-403 Part A.

STAFF RECOMMENDED MOTION

COA #2010-COA-403 B (IRV):

To approve a Certificate of Authorization for the unapproved removal of all the original wood siding (clapboard and shingle) and trim, alleged but not proven by the applicant to have been deteriorated, per submitted documentation and subject to the following stipulations:

- 1. Installation of wood clapboard siding, wood shingle siding, and wood trim must be completed in accordance with 2010-COA-403 Part A (IRV), and**
- 2. The work approved in 2010-COA-403 Part A (IRV) must be completed before December 1, 2010.**

NOTE #1: In approving this certificate of authorization, the IHPC recognizes that there is no possible way to require the reinstallation of the original siding and trim, leaving replication to be the only resolution.

NOTE#2: Failure to install the appropriate wood siding approved in 2010-COA-403 A (IRV) by December 1, 2010 will result in the violation being forwarded to the City Prosecutor and will result in 2010-COA-403 B (IRV) being rescinded.

Staff Reviewer: Meg Purnsley



Below: View of East elevation of house. Markings are visible that show the original location and dimensions of the wood siding and trim.





**Above: Photo of house prior to removal of siding (with aluminum siding still on the house)
Below: Photo of house after aluminum and wood siding were removed.**





Above: View of wood shingles in one of the two dormers. This detail was revealed when the aluminum siding was removed.

Below: View of one piece of wood siding that was left on the house. This piece is located on the rear of the house.





Above: Rear of house when aluminum siding was still intact
Below: Rear of house when aluminum and original wood siding were removed.



INDIANAPOLIS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

APPROVED SEP 02 2010 INDIANAPOLIS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

FILE NUMBER: 2010-COA-403 DATE ISSUED: September 02, 2010 HISTORIC AREA: Irvington

FOR WORK TO BE DONE AT: 5860 LOWELL AVE

APPLICANT: NORCROSS, DEREK J

ADDRESS: 5860 E LOWELL AVE CITY/STATE: INDIANAPOLIS, IN ZIP CODE: 46219

TYPE OF WORK APPROVED UNDER THIS CERTIFICATE:

Approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow installation of new wood lap siding, wood shingles at front gable and west dormer and wood trim on house where removed as per submitted documentation and subject to the following stipulations:

- 1. New siding must be wood (no synthetics) to match the original and must be smooth (no rough-sawn wood) and free of knots and other major imperfections.
2. New siding is to have a reveal to match the original siding on the house (measured from small section of wood siding at rear wall).
3. New wood shingles are to be reinstalled at front gable and on west dormer where missing. Shingles are to match original wood shingles that still remain on a portion of the west-facing dormer in material, shape, size and method of installation.
4. New corner boards, skirt board, drip edge and other missing trim is to be reinstalled to match the original. Dimensions and design of skirtboard and drip edge are to be duplicated from the adjacent house next door (red house directly west of subject property). All existing window and house trim must remain intact and not replaced or altered. Cornerboards are to be sized to match originals (see IHPC staff photos for evidence of cornerboard dimensions).
5. Any deviation from this approach must be approved by IHPC staff prior to commencement of work.
6. No removal of trim, siding or other wood details at front porch are permitted.
7. Siding must be installed in a manner to avoid visible seams.
8. Siding should be properly primed and prepped prior to application of paint.
9. Siding must be painted. No permanent coating systems are permitted.
10. Any unforeseen repairs to the house or other work to be done not included in this approval must be approved by IHPC staff prior to commencement of work.

NOTE: Permits may be required for this scope of work. Please contact the Permits Office at 327-8700 or visit the Permitting Office at 1200 S Madison St.

BY:

Meg Purnsley, Sr. Architectural Reviewer

IHPC HEARING

ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING

STAFF APPROVAL

NOTICE: THIS CERTIFICATE WILL BECOME VOID AFTER: 9/2/2011. CONTACT THE IHPC OFFICE IF AN EXTENSION OF THE EXPIRATION DATE IS NEEDED.

THIS CERTIFICATE IS A PREREQUISITE TO THE ISSUANCE OF ANY BUILDING OR DEMOLITION PERMITS, IMPROVEMENT LOCATION PERMITS, WHEN REQUIRED, AND TO THE GRANTING OF ANY USE VARIANCES OR REZONINGS IN ALL DESIGNATED HISTORIC AREAS OF MARION COUNTY, INDIANA.

INDIANA CODE 36-7 CHAPTER 11.1

THIS CERTIFICATE IS NOT IN AND OF ITSELF PROOF THAT THE MATERIALS AND DOCUMENTS PRESENTED TO OBTAIN A BUILDING, DEMOLITION, IMPROVEMENT LOCATION, OR OTHER PERMITS REFLECT THE SCOPE OF WORK APPROVED BY THE IHPC, UNLESS SAID MATERIALS OR DOCUMENTS BEAR AN APPROVAL STAMP AND DATE FROM THE INDIANAPOLIS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION.



RECORDS



BUILDING FILE



APPLICANT