



agreed to apply for a COA. Since it was at the rear of a property and not highly visible from the street, the Hearing Officer heard this issue at a public hearing. AT&T agreed to alter its color choice and commit to replacing the landscaping that had hidden the previous cabinet. With those stipulations, no one objected and a COA was granted.

Old Northside. Staff began receiving complaints in August from ONS residents about several AT&T installations being done without IHPC approval. In talking with the AT&T representative, staff learned of the installation already completed at 611 E North Street (subject of this application.) AT&T stated that it did not know this location was in a historic district, but agreed to submit an application to retain the work.

### **Reasons Existing Installation is Inappropriate**

To-date, no one has complained of this installation or contacted staff opposed to the request. However, staff does not believe that the installation, as it presently exists, is appropriate for the following reasons:

1. The previous installation was problematic, but was set back somewhat from the North St. sidewalk. The new, larger installation comes out to the sidewalk.
2. There is a lack of screening and no way to provide any.
3. The increase in bollards from 4 to 10 significantly increases the negative visual effect of the installation.
4. Even though the work is contained on an easement, staff believes historic bricks appear to have been asphalted over in the street during installation (at the west edge of Cincinnati Street).
5. The addition of the extra cabinets and equipment has increased the visual negative impact on the surrounding area.
6. The existence of this installation at this location seriously impacts the potential to develop this site appropriately in the future.
7. Staff is not convinced that this is the only possible location for this installation.

### **Alternative Layout**

Because the site is very visible with no landscaping/grass or other screening elements to soften its effect on the area, staff believes relocating or providing adequate screening might be appropriate. Staff's understanding from the letter submitted by the applicant is that they were not successful in making an alternative location work, but they have presented an alternative layout which staff believes helps to mitigate the negative visual impact the installation has. The applicant has made the following changes:

1. The bright yellow bollards are now gray
2. The bollards are 2 ½ feet shorter than the original bollards
3. The applicant is proposing to create a defined landscape area using concrete curbing
4. Plantings are being proposed that include both evergreen and deciduous shrubs screening the area all year

Staff believes this alternative is appropriate in that it will improve the aesthetics of the installation and the surrounding property, it creates a more intentional and less disconnected appearance, and is more in keeping with other installations approved by IHPC staff. Staff has noted in the stipulations, however, that all work must be contained to the easement, must not be built within the right-of-way and the asphalt previously installed over the bricks in Cleveland Street along the east side of the installation must be removed. Staff is also stipulating that a survey be provided as part of the final documentation to definitively identify the location of the right-of-way and the subject easement. If it is determined that any of the proposed work is with the public right-of-way, it may be necessary to bring the request back to the Commission to hear a request for a revised plan or layout. Finally, the boxes have been tagged since the last hearing. Staff is recommending that the tagging be painted over or removed.

## STAFF RECOMMENDED MOTION

**COA # 2009-COA-421 (CAMA):**

**To approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of electronics cabinets for the purpose of U-verse service, concrete pad and bollards at easement on property as per the submitted documentation and subject to the following stipulations:**

- 1. A final site plan and elevations of the proposed alterations to the installation site showing the site surveyed with dimensions and locations of rights-of-way must be approved by IHPC staff prior to commencement of work. Approved \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_**
- 2. The existing historic bricks in Cleveland Street that were asphalted over must be restored back to the original condition (with all asphalt removed from their surfaces).**
- 3. A final landscaping plan must be approved by IHPC staff prior to installation. All landscaping must be maintained at all times. Any dead, damaged or diseased plantings must be replaced with new landscaping to match those originally approved by IHPC staff on the approved landscaping plan.**
- 4. Any changes to the approved plans or scope of work must be approved by IHPC staff prior to commencement of work.**
- 5. Tagging on boxes shall be painted over using paint to match the box colors or shall be removed with graffiti remover.**

**Note: All work must be completed no later than October 1, 2010. Failure to comply with this requirement will result in the case being forwarded to the City Prosecutor for enforcement.**

**Staff Reviewer: Meg Purnsley**



Installation as it looks today



Above and Below: Subject site of installed equipment



Installation before bollards were altered.



Above: 2007 Google Image showing the pre-existing cabinet that was installed in 1991.  
Below: Same view of existing conditions

