

CASE # 2011-COA-352 (HMP)	INDIANAPOLIS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT	Hearing Date OCTOBER 5, 2011
1828-1834 N. CENTRAL AVENUE HERRON-MORTON PLACE		NEW CASE Center Township Council District: 9 Jackie Nytes
Applicant GARY RICE mailing address: 6058 Foxwood Lane Indianapolis, IN 46228		
Owner: HENLEY & MARILYN RICE, & GARY RICE 11105 S. Hoyne Chicago, IL 60643		
CASE		
IHPC COA: 2011-COA-352 (HMP) Temporarily install vinyl siding		
STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval		

STAFF COMMENTS

Background of the Property

The property at 1828-34 N. Central Ave. is made up of two separate historic buildings. At some point, they became combined into one auto service business entity used for auto repair, body shop and auto parts. They have been vacant since 2005.

1828 N. Central - the “Peter Pan” Building. This is a 1-story, Craftsman style, brick commercial building constructed sometime between 1915 and 1927. It was a furniture store in the 1920s and a chemical manufactory in the 1930s. It has dark brown brick highlighted with limestone shields and diamond shapes. The ends are defined by 2 pilasters, and a flat pediment bears a stone table with “Peter Pan” written in raised letters. The storefront was turned into a garage door so it could serve as a garage for the former auto services business.



1830-1834 N. Central – Commercial Building. This is a brick-veneered commercial building built ca. 1923 and served as a Standard Grocery in the 1920s, later as an A&P, and then a paint store before it was combined about 1966 with the Peter Pan building and became Rice Auto. It is 3 bays wide and features a molded metal cornice over the windows and at the parapet. The centered entrance is capped with a limestone pediment.



Background of This Case

The brick veneer on the north wall of the building at 1830-1834 suffered a partial collapse in 2005. Since this has gone unrepaired, Health & Hospital Corporation has cited the owner with repair orders. The building is owned by the Rice family. The son, Gary Rice, wishes to restore the entire property, possibly utilizing historic tax credits, but is presently living in London and will not be able to undertake such a restoration until later next year. In the mean time, he is requesting approval of a temporary measure that will protect the building from further deterioration.

Message from the Owner

In an email to a Herron-Morton Neighborhood Association representative, Mr. Rice explains his family's involvement with the property, his interest in the property and his "preservation" credentials. What follows is an abridged excerpt from that communication, because it explains the situation better than staff is able to do. Mr. Rice plans to attend the October IHPC meeting.

Abridged Email to Jonathan Chumley, HMP representative:

My father purchased the building and the business in 1966, establishing the business as Rice Auto Parts and Supply and becoming the first African-American auto parts wholesaler in the State of Indiana. I grew up working in the business alongside my parents and sisters. The business closed in 2005 after my father, who will be 91 in October, suffered a series of strokes. Our former tenant, Samsung Auto Body moved out of the building about two years ago. The building has been vacant since then. My mother and father reside on the north side of Indianapolis.

I graduated from Ball State University, College of Architecture and Planning. I later studied business at the University of Chicago. In college, I became involved with the Muncie Urban Design Studio where I studied under Tony Costello and Scott Truex. I interned for Ball Corporation and subsequently with the Community Development department for the City of Muncie. My first professional work was in Muncie as a neighborhood planner assigned as staff member to the Muncie Historic Preservation Commission. I was instrumental in establishing the Muncie Facade Restoration grant program. I served for a short time as the Principal Planner for the Delaware-Muncie Metropolitan Plan Commission.

I have always been involved in my local community, having worked with Dorothy Burse and Hazel Stewart in the early 1980's as a member of the Citizens Neighborhood Coalition to enable it to become the lead community organization for the former PK2 planning area. My family sold the former nursing home at 1812 Central Avenue to Citizens making it one of the early rehabilitation projects in Herron Morton Place.

I moved to the Chicago area and worked for the City of Aurora in two roles. First as the Executive Director for Historic Preservation, and then as the Chief Plans Examiner in Building Permits. I left the employ of the City of Aurora to practice architecture as Stackhouse Rice Architects for several years. It was during that period that Mayor Richard M. Daley appointed me to serve on the Building Board of Appeals for the City of Chicago, where I served for three years.

In 2002, I moved to Europe. Since 2005 I have worked for and lived in Southwark, one of the six central London boroughs. I joined Southwark as the Principal Design and Conservation (Historic Preservation) Officer and quickly rose to become the head of the unit in 2007. I oversee the work of 60 staff including planners, architects, urban designers, an arboricultural officer, and an archeologist. There are 41 historic districts in Southwark and approximately 2200 listed buildings.

I trust that this information gives you some confidence in my background, knowledge, skills, and professional abilities in shaping important places. I will approach the temporary works and soon-to-follow rehab of the Peter Pan building with the same level of commitment and expertise, and hope to build a collaborative and cooperative relationship with area residents.

Proposal for Temporary Repairs

The applicant proposes temporary work to protect the building from the elements and comply with repair orders. At first glance, one might think that simply re-laying the brick is the best answer. However, that task will not be easy as there is damage to the structure behind the brick and the distance between this wall and its neighbor is only 30 inches, which will complicate the restoration of the brick façade. The failed brick would be salvaged for reuse, and repairs made to the wood framing and sheathing. After framing repairs, the applicant proposes the installation of vinyl siding for a period not to exceed 18 months. This siding is to be removed and replaced with appropriate materials as part of a certified rehabilitation which will be applied for at a later date. The vinyl siding proposed is "Restoration Smooth" by Wolverine Siding Systems. The applicant believes the siding will provide a weather tight seal while the building awaits further work.

Herron-Morton Place Historic Area Plan

“Replacement of original siding is generally justified only by documented problems with the material’s structural condition.”

The brick veneer has suffered from a catastrophic failure. In the long term, masonry needs to be utilized to make repairs, and vinyl siding would not be considered as a permanent solution, but temporary replacement with vinyl siding as a means to an end for permanent repairs may be justified in this case.

“Damage to masonry is usually caused by movement or water infiltration. Causes should be identified and stopped before undertaking repairs.”

The reasoning behind the temporary repairs is the ability to protect the building while planning the full repairs that address the building’s needs.

Justification for Certificate of Appropriateness

This work falls under “stabilization”, which the Plan outlines as a “*process involving methods which reestablish a deteriorated property’s structural stability and weather tightness while sustaining its existing form.*” The siding is a means to stabilize the building and prevent further deterioration. Staff believes that protecting a building that has been open to the elements for so long is more crucial than the temporary protection selected. This work is only intended as a stop-gap measure.

STAFF RECOMMENDED MOTION

COA #2011-COA-352 (HMP):

To approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install vinyl siding on the north façade per documentation submitted and subject to the following stipulations:

- 1) The retention of the vinyl siding shall not exceed a period of 18 months from the granting of this COA.**
- 2) Siding shall only be applied on the north façade that has veneer failure.**
- 3) Siding shall be smooth finish and create a weather tight surface.**
- 4) Staff must approve the color and “lap” before installation. *Approved: _____ Date: _____***

Staff Reviewer: Emily Jarzen



Map of subject property



View of property from Central Avenue



View of rear façade & north wall from alley



Veneer failure evident in 2005